

The Study and Measurement of Urban Governance toward the Justice Evaluation in the City of Tehran

Ali Maherⁱ, Mohammad Hossain Salarianzadehⁱⁱ, Farhad Sadrⁱⁱⁱ, Seyed Manaf Hashemi^{iv}

Abstract

Less privileged urban areas are regarded as the objective cases of injustice resulted from the present socioeconomic policies and mechanisms and the inefficiency of the urban management system and structure. Lack of a practical mechanism to measure the justice and to identify and choose the appropriate interventions to eliminate the injustice, has impeded urban development, made the policymakers face uncertainty, of the integrity of their choice and induced problems on the way of beneficiaries to participate. The traditional approach of implementing the governmental management in the cities has induced challenges on the executives, and these challenges have affected the political ties, decision making and accountability processes, roles and responsibilities of the public sector institutions and resource appropriation for urban development. Hence, we are observing a transition from government to governance. Beside, establishing systems to measure the life quality in cities, many states have considered the measurement of urban governance indices, so that the urban management can obtain a bright vision of the quality of neighborhood administration and revision of its corrective measures across the city.

This study is aimed at increasing public participation, developing the inter-sector cooperation, and reinforcing the policymakers to recognize accurately the social risks across cities and their consequences in particular the impacts of injustice and eliminating it. Hence, the performance of 22 municipality regions in the systematic and clear accountability to citizens, their financial and social participation, municipality standard activities and citizen satisfaction was studied. This study is based on the governance approach in Urban Heart Paradigm as the justice measurement framework. This paradigm provides the authorities with the well-structured necessary evidence for evaluating the present situation and reacting to health unfair situations in urban scope, and through offering a clear guide, assists the national and local policymakers to identify the unfairness in the health and life situation of the people residing the less privileged areas with other areas and make the appropriate policies. Considering the conceptual framework of the mentioned paradigm, the indices were classified and used into three social, economic and institutional scopes.

Studying the governance scope indices separated for Tehran municipality 22 regions, indicates that the average performance of region municipalities in 2008 in the fields of accountability, public participation, citizen satisfaction, and standard and clear performance equals to 55.32%, implying the mediocre performance of this executive institution.

Introduction

Increased immigration to cities, weakness in predicting the services required by these areas and lack of the necessary ability in rendering services fairly to allover the city on one hand, and transition of the agricultural economy to commercial-industrial economy, increased life expenses in cities, increasing congestion of population in a geographical area and the increasing expectations of households on the other, set the stage for formation of suburban areas, and less-privileged and poor urban areas, being considered as the objective symbols of injustice in urban community and inefficiency of the existing socioeconomic policies and mechanisms and urban management system. Different ideas have been proffered and sometimes experienced about getting rid of this unbalanced condition. But, certainly the need to redefinition of justice in the situation of sustainable growth and development and good governance is regarded as necessary

Regarding the definition of equity, some define it as Equality. Some others view equity as the minimum access to what produces tranquility and peace in the society. Aristotle defines equity as moderation in works. According to this definition everybody should be given his/her right portion. Based on the profit-oriented analyses, equity is a system that, in the status of reconciling two conflicting parties, satisfies the domination of majority interests. In the other world, this view justifies the inequity on the minority in favor of majority. According to Ali (PBUH) equity is the divine tradition, the factor contributing to nation persistence, government stability, and the contributor to the urban reclamation. It is written in Achaemenid Cyrus's will that "if you neglect the exertion of equity you will soon lose your value. According to WHO, an urban health system is required to attempt both horizontally and vertically for rendering fair health services. In the other word, this system should treat equally with those with identical health and medical needs (horizontal equity), and should set more protection for those with more needs (vertical equity) in order to achieve decreased inequity in the scope of health. According to Roberts et al, the important point is that the entire financial resources of health care, whether directly or indirectly, are supplied by the people, and what seems important in this regard, is the fact that the finance system should be organized so that to ensure the equity in distributing the burden of service costs.

On the other hand, till 1980s, the governments were assumed to have the ability to govern the country. But the transformations in the temporary world have given a new form to the urban community and its relationships. Modern urban community with features such as population heterogeny, high social mobility, vast social classification, and new sociopolitical organization, along with diverse and sporadic political, social and civil demands of citizens, have contributed to formation of new relationships between them and local governments (urban governments).

Hence, we are witness to increased transformations in political relationships, decision making and accountability processes, job divisions, and distribution of the responsibilities of public sector corporations among the different government levels, relationship with the providers of services outside the government and appropriation of financial resources for urban development. Thus, the challenges against the traditional approach of public institution governance in administrating the urban affairs, has affected different aspects of governance and management. The traditional approach with a monopolistic vision, used to restrain the management in the closes circle of government and the governmental organizations, and neglecting the inter-sector cooperation, regarded little rights for non-governmental sectors and institutions in administrating the cities, and consequently exerted the maximum participation only in the informatics.

Emergence and resonance of the increasing inefficiency of this approach in urban planning and weak performance of local governments in comprehensively supplying urban utilities, has led to emergence of a new approach in urban management and administration in the middle of 1980s. In early 1990s, following the emergence of vast social transformations and demand for increasing public political participation, the authoritarian governments tended to a type of expanded democratization. Consequently, a sort of transition from the government's centralist structures to the society's participation-seeking structures in decision making and execution, namely a transition from government approach to governance approach. Brian McLoughlin proposed in early 1970s that there is an increasing demand that urban government should be more accountable toward the trend of transformation across the city, its efforts should be more proportionate with urban issues and their revolutions, and should be more accountable to the community, and should finally play an important role in predicting, discovering and welcoming future. These processes highly rely on the existence of communication network between the organizations and the society and its urban systems. But in order for the urban government to act efficiently as the regulating system, it needs to get continuous information of the social system. Proportion, accountability and versatility of the government strongly depend on the communications with that society, so that the facts, ideas, demands, and proposals are transferred into the official institutions.

According to McLoughlin, the government is a set of official and legal institutions with legal authority. But governance is a process. This process ensures the contiguous system involving both the government and the society. Accountability, proportion and providence in governance, the ability to encounter effectively with the current issues, and predicting the events, not only depend on the official organizational networks, but it also presupposes unofficial networks; networks that enable people perform the tasks when official networks fail in doing them. Efforts made a couple of decades after him by the international organizations such as World Bank, led to the acceptance of the distinction between the terms "Governance", and "Government".

But the main question here is that what the reliance point and **Achilles Heel** is in transition from government to governance. Colebatch opines that in recent years, governance has been widely

used to conceive the government processes and administration of the complicated contemporary societies. To him, utilization and development of this concept is done for a number of reasons:

- In the scope of Political science, a growing awareness has emerged that the government are not only the decision makers and decision executors through governmental power, but they also spend lots of time on negotiating with other governmental or non-governmental organizations to agree on specific decisions and measures
- In such a scope, the extragovernmental participants are recognized as beneficiaries. They have the right to intervene in the decision makings related to what should occur and in exerting them.
- The government is under increasing pressures to assign its tasks as contracts to non-governmental institutes, and simply regulate what is being performed. In such a situation, control is more based on market competition than on bureaucratic rules.
- This issue implies that the international relationships are not only defined within the boundary of governments, but government-free governance can be seen.

The outcome of this attitude is that the government's task is not only to make and implement the decisions, but to integrate the measures and activities of a wide spectrum of the participants and amending the affairs are the main tasks of the government in the new prospect. According to Osborne and Gaebler, the governments should lead but should not steer. This is also evident in the word of Ali (PBUH) where he says: “Attempting in favor of the public is the perfection of prosperity. Reviewing the literature related to governance suggests two dominating views: analytical view and normative view. The normative view has been proposed by international development organizations, such as UNDP (United Nations Development Plan) and World Bank in recent decades and has been offered to different countries as recommendation packages. UNDP makes distinction between economic, political, administrative-executive, and systematic governance. Economic governance is related to decision makings influencing directly on economic activity. Political governance is related to the policy makings performed by legal bodies and authorities. Administrative-executive governance is related to execution of policies through accountable, independent, and efficient public sector. Systematic governance is related to social structures and processes directing the political, economic, and social relationships and protecting religious-cultural values and creates an environment in which health, freedom, security and life quality can be secured and ensured.

According to the World Bank, good governance consists of efficient and competent administration under the legitimate and democratic urban government. Therefore, the development study group of this institution has been surveying the governance indices measurement annually and has been publishing the results under Worldwide Governance Indicators in 212 territories.

Based on this study, governance involves processes of election, supervision, and replacement of governments, government's capacity in effectively compiling and executing correct policies, and

adjusting the relationship between the citizens and the government in economic fields and social interaction between them this study, conducted under the wider plan of measuring the factors and influences of good governance, consists of six aspects, and several criteria are defined to measure each aspect. The mentioned criteria in 2007 included 340 separate measures gathered from 5 resources and 32 organizations. The six aspects and the general discussions proposed in measuring any of them, based on which the criteria are determined include:

- 1- Accountability- Measuring the conception of citizens from participation in electing the government, freedom of speech, freedom of gatherings, and freedom of media.
- 2- Political Stability and Absence of Violence/Terrorism)- Measuring the perception of the probability that the government is likely to become unstable illegally and coercively and/or be replaced.
- 3- Government effectiveness: Measuring the perception of the quality of the services provided and their degree of independence from political pressures, policymaking quality and the validity of government commitment to execution of policies.
- 4- Regulatory Quality: Measuring the perception of the government ability in compiling and executing the policies and regulations authorizing the private sector and encouraging its development.
- 5- Rule of Law- Measuring the perception of the trust and obedience of the executive agents from communal principles.
- 6- Control of Corruption: measuring the perception of the amount of what public sectors spend to attain personal profit

Based on these aspects, the 8 criteria of good governance include strategic perspective, beneficiary participation, Rule of Law, performance clarity, responsibility, equity, effectiveness and efficiency, and accountability. WHO also adds security and moralities to the above criteria. Hence, government and public bodies are no longer regarded as the dominating element in development. Under the new approach, private sector, non-governmental institutions, foundations, and international organizations, and individuals and households act in an allied manner. Therefore, in the transition to the governance approach, the urban management faces pressures both internally and externally. Its internal necessity depends on the public demands for their higher participation in the urban management process and the economic and organizational necessity of the private sector participation in urban administration and public service provision. Its external necessity is the pressure and encouragement of the international bodies made possible through offering some facilities and scientific, financial and physical assistance.

In the new prospect, governance is the application of political, economic and administrative power to manage the community affairs, through which the citizens express their interests, claim their legal rights, and practice their commitments. And good governance occurs only when the society's problems and challenges are resolved in an accountable, clear, efficient, equity-oriented, and law-oriented environment. Establishing this new approach in the current situation, in fact endures the political stability as one of the four pillars of stability along with economic,

environmental and social stability. Hence, many countries, notwithstanding the absence of a practical mechanism for measurement of fair governance in particular in the scope of society health, beside establishing systems for measurement of urban life quality, have included the measurement of urban governance indices in their agenda so that the planning and urban management authorities attain the following general objectives in this way:

- 1- Presenting a clear image of the quality of administrating and managing the cities, neighborhoods and urban regions
- 2- Enhancing people's public awareness of the manner of urban administration and governance and awareness of the citizenship rights
- 3- Guiding and supporting other planning authorities through providing invaluable data on improvement of urban governance system
- 4- Constant improvement and reconsideration of urban governance quality

Today, management in many cities in developed countries deals with reconsidering and revising the qualitative level of human-natural ecosystem and governance system, by establishing a dynamic system, so that to find a clear criterion for the qualitative and qualitative effectiveness of their intervention in urban management system and the amount of equity. Certainly, the establishment of such a system for Tehran, in addition to depicting the urban administration quality can provide the urban executives with a tool for measuring the qualitative level of people lives, determining the amount of equity in enjoying the services and how to enhance it. Launching such a system for this metropolis which often holds a low rank in the environmental and management quality worldwide, can be a good initial pace for this Capital of the region's top country in the Outlook Horizon.

The Governance indices measurement plan for assessment of equity in Tehran City Health was executed by Tehran municipality during 2008-2009 with the general purpose of enhancing fairly the health level of citizens with helping the society in recognizing the required gaps, priorities, and interventions, helping the main policymakers and beneficiaries in deeply understanding social risks and their related consequences, and assisting the executives, and staff in developing the inter-sector participation in adopting and implementing strategies resolving the equities in the scope of health.

Research Methodology

In the present study the following objectives are considered:

- 1- Helping the society in realizing the gaps, priorities and interventions required in 2007 to resolve the gaps and enhance the equity in health.
- 2- Helping the main policymakers and beneficiaries for more comprehensive and profound understanding of social risks and the related consequences in the scope of health, particularly in encountering the poor and the vulnerable classes

- 3- Provoking the main policymakers, planners, and beneficiaries to adopt strategic decisions and prioritize the specialized activities and measures toward resolving the inequities.
- 4- Assisting the executives and personnel in developing inter-sector cooperation and participation regarding the strategies related to different health components

In the process of research, after examining and analyzing Tehran Municipality's and its affiliated departments' documents and data and the polling conducted in 2007 in Tehran and performing the limited survey regarding some criteria, due to the time limitation, secondary analysis was chosen as the main research methodology. Difference measurement and ranking 22 regions, 9 deputies, and 50 organizations and companies affiliated to Municipality were targeted in terms of systematic accountability, and structured reporting to decision makers and citizens, multiplicity and financial volume of clear tenders, citizen financial and social participation, the amount of municipality's standard activities and citizen satisfaction. But the important thing is the theoretical and practical paradigm for measuring these criteria.

In recent years, finding a practical model to measure the equity in enhancing the health level in the city of Tehran and applying its results in policymaking and planning the urban development, are some of the concerns harbored by Tehran Municipality management. In this regard, the joint committee of Health strategic studies office at Tehran municipality and the regional office of WHO was constituted and during the continuous meetings, Urban Heart paradigm was chosen as equity measurement paradigm. The Urban Heart paradigm is the product of Kube Governorship, Japan, WHO and local authorities of knowledge network in the urban environment. This paradigm is intended to provide the health system authorities with the evidence required to assess the present situation, and reaction to health unfair situation in urban scope. Presenting a simple guide, this paradigm helps the national and local policymakers identify the inequities in health and sustenance of people residing poor and less privileged areas with other urban areas and decide with what policies and plans the inequalities among the residents can be reduced.

This paradigm is divided into two components: assessment and accountability. The assessment component is designed to determine the performance difference among urban regions, and uses main indices and 4 main political domain influencing health outcomes. These four policy domains include: physical environment and infrastructure, social and human development, governance and economic development. The second component of the paradigm, accountability, leads the users in determining the strategies, policies, plans, and designs to be presented for realization, or should be continued, develop, enhanced and/or altered or even stopped. The paradigm proposes 5 strategies and about 300 dedicated activities or interventions, (derived from the evidence resulting from the assessment component) for neutralizing the inequity in health and in fairness in health situation.

The present study is intended to measure the indices of urban governance in the city of Tehran from Assessment, the first component of Urban Heart paradigm. In the macro-plan of Tehran Municipality, as the subset of joint committee, a number of committees were established

including the special committee for determining governance indices, and considering the conceptual paradigm of the mentioned paradigm and the criteria of good governance in different resources and considering the situation of Iran, the initial index list based on the availability criteria, importance, comparability with global sizes and their derivability from the performance was chosen. Afterwards, through holding the joint meetings of the governance scope committee and the study team, and through the initial test of index availability, trivial changes were necessary in the initial indices and the following indices were finalized:

- 1- Citizen satisfaction: In this study, citizen satisfaction in 25 topics including regular gathering of garbage and wastage, development and maintenance of green spaces, traffic control, passage lighting situation, encounter with pollutant industries, addressing the city's appearance, confronting with vermin animals, dealing with the situation of sidewalks and street pavements, installation of Traffic signs, desirable behavior with Municipality clients, conditions of markets and public fruit stores and the condition of public parking lots. Were studied.
- 2- Systematic Accountability- In this study, the number of citizen registered messages at the system 137 and the system 1888 in 23007 and the reasons behind their calls and also the results of ISPA polling centers in 2006 were studied.
- 3- Organized accountability- Considering the expansion of the function scope, various and numerous reports is prepared. Considering the fact that the governance scope reports were defined as one of the reporting scopes in the municipality, and considering the limited time and executive power, it was first decided, to get the reports from all regional municipalities on what reports to be assessed. Then, using Delphi Method, the report assessment and scoring criteria were studied and the results of the statistical analysis were proffered at governance committee meeting and the final criteria for assessment of the reports and their importance indices were approved. Further, the structure and concept of municipality reports were examined in the governance committee, and the issues related to governance with qualitative and quantitative indices of report compilation were inducted and the differentiation and junction points of the report were determined. Finally, four current report topics (performance report, budget report, neighborhood development document report, Crusade plan report 137) were chosen for assessment.
- 4- Social Participation of Citizens- Based on the initial paradigm proposed by the urban governance, the participation of the residents' participation in the elections in general, and in local councils in particular was assigned as the variable for measuring Tehran Citizens' social participation. The large size and complexity of a metropolis like Tehran and the accessibility and measurability of the participation in the elections are the main reasons why this variable was preferred by the committee. In this study, considering the holding of local council elections in two times in 2008, the emphasis was on using the election data. But in practice, the inaccessibility and unreliability of the above data persuaded the study team to replace them by another variable. By studying the detailed studies and polling conducted in recent years, the

attention was attracted to the results of the studies done in the national polling center titled "the influence of Tehran Municipality Utility Services on the lifestyle" in 2007 and 2008.

5- Size and Volume of Clear Tenders- the size of clear tenders in the municipality consists of the number of contracts concluded with complete legal transparency without quitting tender formalities, and/or through limited tender mechanism, and the size of transparent tenders consists of the Rial volume ratio of the contracts concluded with complete legal transparency without quitting the tender formalities or through limited tender mechanism. After gathering the number of contracts and tenders done in Tehran municipality, in 2007, as separated by 22 regions, deputies, and organizations affiliated to municipality and analysis of the data gathered, the ratio of the number of tenders held based on the law, to the total number of contracts concluded through tender was calculated and was classified in three categories: over 63% (desirable), between 33 to 66% (relatively desirable) and less than 33% (undesirable).

6- Citizens' Financial Participation – Considering the importance of citizen participation in management of metropolises and the necessity of the interaction and mutual understanding with the citizens for management of municipality as a social institution, measuring the ratio of the income yielded by public participation to the entire income of the region and the municipality is of great importance in determining the effectiveness of good urban governance.. But due to the absence of funding row to attract public contributions, it was actually impossible to separate the revenues yielded by public contributions and from other contributions, and inevitably, we confine to the participations of real and legal entities with direct investment in each project.

7- Size of standard Processes- Rule of Law is an index introduced as an independent index in most urban governance measurement models. The concepts proffered in this index include observation of people's right in society, and rights of minorities, equity of everybody against law, and the independence of the arbitration institution. In this study, considering discussions made in governance committee, it was dealt with the legal processes of municipality and measurement of their standards, because processes are constantly effective only if they are standard. Being a standard activity means being documented, durable, effective and efficient. A documented activity is in a written form or in the form of a flowchart, transparent for all addresses. Durability means it should not change as the directors are replaced. Effectiveness and efficiency means integrity and good implementation of activities.

In this study, the degree of implementation and establishment of legal processes rushed by citizens was introduced as the scale for municipality's adherence to the commitment toward executing the standard processes. The reason behind confining to the above aspect of Rule of Law and negligence of other aspects (type of legislation, regulating the enforcement of law, etc.) is the time limitation and almost lack of reliable documented information. Considering the resource limitations, it was emphasized on 14 popular processes classified in six categories of construction certificate issuance processes, getting record clearance, and operation certificate, construction accomplishment certificate, paying annual fees/ getting clearance certificate, issuance of application change permit, and visiting municipality authorities. Since the processes are often measured within the paradigms of performance assessment, in this section, after the

relative study of the prevalent models, the organizational excellence paradigm was chosen as the assessment execution method. In the organizational excellence model, the RADAR logic is offered to measure the organization processes; in the other words, the organization processes, should have approaches, be spread over the organizational principles, the organization performance should be assessed based on that, and should be revised when necessary. Further, considering the above logic, the measurement tools were selected and designed. Considering the necessity of gathering filed information, questionnaire has been the tool used in this part.

Findings

Questionnaire studies, interviews, collective meetings, text studies and the reporting indicated the following results in 2007:

1- Citizen Satisfaction:

Through examining the definitions of client satisfaction, it becomes clear that the satisfaction of the clients is a cognitive process differing based on different people cognitions and is the result of the formation of a desirability and pleasure status resulting from satisfaction of needs and requirements of the clients. The degree of satisfaction with the performance of Tehran municipality in the regions was estimated 57% in average. At the other extreme, citizen satisfaction as separated by 25 indices was estimated to be about 46.47%.

2- Systematic Accountability- In Islam, as human is a free entity, he is accountable before God, himself and other creatures for all of his decisions and acts. According to Islam, tool of fruition is not personal and collective, but is a means bestowed by God to the governors. On the other hand, the governor also has a right on vassals, namely questioning and supervision. In this case, accountability assumes its complete form. Of 1197472 citizen messages were registered at the system 137 in 2007. 100000 messages were registered monthly, of which about 57% ended with messages, and the remaining 43% is related to pursuance, getting information on urban rules, informatics, and calls irrelative to municipality scope of work. Nevertheless, according to the study by ISPA polling center in 2006, only 32.5% were acquainted with 137, 46.5% of which had called it. But the statistics in 2007 indicated a 100% increase with a satisfaction rate of 71.5%. On the other hand, only about 20% of Tehran citizens were familiar with the system 1888, and only 25% had called this center. Of this number, about 53% were satisfied with the results of their calls.

3- Organized Reporting- Generally speaking, the organizational reporting is a part of accountability system. The main duties of the organization in the scope of accountability are divided to 3 scopes of organization managers, internal customer thoughts, and accountability to extra-organizational thinking. Report is prepared in the organization as one of the purposeful activities to examine the growth process and qualitative and quantitative enhancement by different departments and taking advantage of the

comparison of report results in different periods get aware on the organizational performance.

Based on the assessment conducted on 4 current reports, the results indicate that in the reports of regional one-year performance in 2007, the average total score of the regions was 3 of 10, of which the report on performance of regions 1, 2 and 4 has been good, and the report on the performance of regions 14, 15, and 20 has been weak. The average total region score in the 1-year reports of regional strategic plan in the same year has been 2.18 of 10. The reports of regional strategic plan for regions 2, 15, and 7 have been good and for regions 21 and 12 has been weak. The budget appropriation reports, considering the similar format notified to all regions has been prepared identically. But based on assessment criteria, the above format had defections and attained only 4.96 scores of 10. Considering the identical completion of the mentioned format, the score of all regions in the budget appropriation report has been gained as 4.96. Also regarding the 137 crusade plan reports, in 2007, the average total score of the regions has been 3.2 of 10, and the reports of regions 11, 14 and 15 had good situation and regions 9, 19, 10 and 2 had undesirable situation.

Thus, average total score of Tehran municipality regions in the four above reports was gained as 3.37 of 10, and the systemic reporting index in Municipality regions indicate that three regions 1, 2, and 15 has been in appropriate status and regions 20, 10 and 12 were the weakest in the reporting status.

- 4- Citizen Social Participation- Social participation is a process through which social groups join each other to execute the performance expected or required by the society. French sociologist, French, believes that participation is a process during which two or more groups interplay in compiling the plan. Policy and a certain decision. In this case, the size of participation of a moderate person is the influence affecting on their decision while getting their decision (Matin, 1999, 115). Social participation denotes that kind of willful activities through which members of a society participate in the affairs of neighbor, city, village, and play role directly or indirectly in forming the social life (Mohseni Tabrizi, 1992:108).

Based on the information of the plan “the influence of utility services of Tehran Municipality on Lifestyle”, Tehran citizens’ participation in separating dry and wet garbage, shooting the garbage out at night, avoiding the scattering of garbage in sidewalks and protecting the green space and encouraging others to meet the sanity were in total 87.1%. In this regard, the cooperation of residents of regions 22, 3 and 4 in administrating the utility services was in good status, and cooperation of residents of regions 19, 6, 11 and 1 has been in weak status in comparison with other regions.

- 5- Size and volume of transparent tenders: According to the law of tenders, tender is a competitive process to provide the considered quality in which the commitments under transaction are assigned to the tender party who has bid the lowest proportionate price. According to this law, the transactions with the value over 200000000 Rials require the

holding of tender. In terms of verification procedures, tenders are classified into one-step, two-step, public, limited and those without formalities. It was revealed in the studies that the municipality contracts are concluded as public (transparent) tenders, limited tenders, and assignment to the affiliated companies and other companies without tenders. Among the 22 regions, regions 20 and 22 with 76% have the highest percentage of the number of transparent tenders and region 19 with 20.71% has the lowest transparent tenders toward the entire contracts concluded. Also, regions 10, 20 and 22 are included among good regions and regions 15 and 19 are included in weak regions group.

Among the 22 regions, region 20 with 77.54 has the highest and region 15 with 14.42% the lowest percentage of Rial volume in transparent tenders toward the entire contracts concluded in 2007. Also, regions 20, 22, 16 and 21 were included in good regions group and regions 5, 15 and 19 were included in weak regions group. The total average of the regions was 49.7%.

6- Citizen Financial Participation: Financial participation can be divided into two main groups:

- A) Participation in profits: In this case, real and legal entities are able to participate in securing the resources for operation of plans with receiving fair profit. The main source of finance for the operational activities, are the incomes yielded through the plans, fees and taxes playing a major role in supplying the revenues of municipality. Public participation In Iran is manifested more in paying fees than in other resources.
- B) Participation in Resources-In this status, real and natural entities are able to participate through direct participation in each project and benefit from the profit yielded based on the agreement and their portion.

Based on the study conducted, both participation in profits and resources in 2007 have been so limited that it was not practically possible to judge the performance of regions and organizations in attracting financial contributions. Based on the information gained from the regions, totally 32 participatory projects (between private sector and municipality) have been being performed only in 11 regions. There were no participatory projects in the remaining 11 regions. Of the abovementioned 32 projects, 9 have been in region 1 and 7 in region 6. The important point about the financial participation is that the abovementioned projects have been practiced through the innovation of regional municipalities and or proposals of private sector.

7- Quantity of Standard Processes: According to the scores gained by municipalities of 22 regions, as separated by any of the 6 process sets related to clients, it can be concluded that:

In the processes of issuing construction permit, including plan change permit, destruction and reconstruction, construction development, reparation and permit renewal, regions 1, 10 and 19 gained the first ranks and regions 21, 22, and 20 gained the lowest score. Certificate gaining processes include getting no-breach certificate and permission. Assessment of certificate gaining processes indicates that regions 1 and 10 gained the first ranks and regions 21 and 4 gained the

lowest scores. Processes of annual fee payment and getting clearance include the payments of professions, vehicles, and reconstruction fees. In these processes, regions 1, 10 and 16 gained the highest and regions 4 and 21 the lowest ranks. Examining the process of getting the completion certificate indicated that regions 1 and 10 gained the highest score and regions 4 and 21 gained the lowest scores in the table of this assessment. The process of getting application change permit is another process related to clients and was assessed in this plan. Regarding this process, regions 1 and 10 gained the highest and regions 22, 4, 21, 17 had the lowest scores. In the process of meeting municipality authorities region 9 excels other regions and is evaluated to be in a good position, but regions 13, 14, 5, and 6 were in improper position with the lowest scores.

To aggregate and conclude the process assessment, the total scores gained by the regions indicate that regions 1 and 10 were assessed to be in good position and regions 4 and 21 with the lowest scores in an improper position. Of the entire 6 processes, the process of meeting municipality authorities was assessed at the first rank and in a good position.

Results

This study is the first one in measuring the urban governance in Iran comprising of study results in 8 indices under the plan of measuring equity in the city of Tehran. The time range of the cited data, except some cases, were related to 2007 and the scope of study was Tehran municipality, its deputies and affiliated organizations. But the main emphasis is on index measurement at regional level. As mentioned in the discussions pertaining to any index, data resources and analysis level at any index is as follows:

Satisfaction: the satisfaction index based on the modulated results of Technology organization surveys, social deputy, and ISPA have been analyzed secondarily. The survey by Technology organization in 2007 has been conducted as separated by 25 main scopes of activity and separated by 22 regions. ISPA survey also measured the citizen level of satisfaction with Tehran municipality in 2008. Considering the existence of satisfaction data in two time sections (2007, 2008), also trend analysis has been done on the level of satisfaction.

Accountability: This index consists of accountability and systemic reporting systems. In both indices, the analyses were conducted relying on the resources gathered in this study. Systematic accountability index, based on the data registered on the satisfaction with pursuance and the results of citizens' calls to the system 137 in 2007, the satisfaction with system 137 based on ISPA survey in 2007, and satisfaction with public supervision system 1888 was measured based on the results of ISPA survey in 2007. The measurement was done based on all three resources, separated by 22 regions of Tehran municipality, in the data registered with system 137, separated to 20 main scopes of the system, and in ISPA survey based on the general satisfaction of citizens familiar with the systems 137 and 1888. Considering the availability of the data on satisfaction with accountability of system 137 in two time sections (2007 and 2008) trend analysis was also done on the level of accountability.

Systemic reporting Index has been prepared based on evaluation of 4 types of reports prepared in 2007 in region municipalities, deputies, organizations and companies affiliated to Tehran Municipality. The report included the report of one-year performance, neighborhoods strategic plan report, budget appropriation report, and crusade (Jihad) plan 137. The reports are provided

based on 15 criteria of standard report and as separated by regions, deputies, organizations and affiliated companies.

Transparency

Emphasizing financial transparency, the transparency index measured the number and volume of tenders in regional municipalities in 2007. The measurement was conducted based on type of contract and the resources gathered in this study. Contracts resulting from public tenders had the highest transparency and contracts resulting quitting tenders and without tenders had the least transparency in the measurement. The data have been gotten from financial deputies of the regional municipalities and the data available in planning and coordinating deputy system in 2007.

Participation

This index consists of social and financial participation of the citizens in governing the urban affairs. The social participation index is a secondary analysis based on part of a study titled "the influence of utility services of municipality on lifestyle", conducted for Tehran municipality office in 2007 and 2008. The 8 categories used in this study done as separated by regions indicate the spirit of participation in Tehran citizens. But the financial participation index principally lacks a specific plan or row in regional municipalities and the data available in financial participation (participation in resources), lacks the capability to be cited and assessed among the regions. However, the results gathered, are reflected in the report as separated by regions.

Rule of Law: rule of law was concentrated on possessing and implementing the standard processes in regional municipalities and was performed through choosing 6 categories of current popular processes in regional municipalities. Generally, the processes related to clients in Tehran municipality have been planned in a relatively appropriate manner and the municipality, based on its policies and missions holds a transparent approach in this regard. Although this approach is not yet systematically operational and no specific mechanism implying the relationship between the processes and requirements and client wants is not yet applied in planning. The available planned processes enjoy a successful level of implementation. Of the most prominent implications of this are the specificity of the process managers, training them for correct execution of processes and performance of municipality personnel according to the procedures defined in the processes.

On the other hand, results indicate that the municipality has not yet planned a specific and compiled mechanism for assessment and revision of processes. The weak results gained in the scope of assessment and revision, imply two things. First, considering the absence of specific assessment mechanism, there is naturally no specific mechanism to register the outcomes resulting from the execution of the process. The other point is that, part of the reason behind absence of assessment system, roots back in the absence of objectives and certain prospect insight in relation with the results of processes. Hence, Tehran municipality score is impaired in this area.

Modulated Results of Governance Indices: Examining the indices of governance as separated by 22 regions of Tehran municipality indicates that the performance of regions 22, 20, 10 and 1

regarding the indices of governance (totally 7 indices) have been desirable in 2007. The performance of regions 15, 19, 12 and 5 in governance indices have been weak and performance of the other 14 regions has been average. The best performance in observing governance indices in 2007 has been related to region 22 of Tehran municipality and the weakest performance has been related to region 15. the average total score of regional municipalities in the abovementioned year of the indices of governance has been 55.32% implying an average performance. In none of the regions, all 7 examined indices studied have been in good position. Given the data of 2007, in region 22, 4 indices were in satisfactory position and in regions 20 and 21, three indices were in satisfactory position and in regions 1, 2, 10 and 13, two indices have been in satisfactory position. Performance of regions 9, 14 and 18 in all seven indices has been average. Regions 4, 12, and 19 had the highest weak performances in three indices and regions 7 and 15 in two indices.

Proposals

For the accountability of urban management toward unfairness in access to urban utilities, the following strategies are recommended:

- Targeting the urban poor
- Giving priority to equity in service distribution as the first agenda of local governments and metropolitan authorities
- Pursuing the issue of "Healthy Cities" as the national agenda

And in order to ensure the effectiveness of the chosen strategy, the following items can be considered as the criteria for choosing accountability strategies:

- They should positively influence the health, social and economic indices of the poor and vulnerable classes
- They should be implementable
- They should be acceptable to people
- Local resources should suffice the implementation of the measures
- They should be proportionate to the available technology
- The results should be achievable in the agreed upon time
- They should be cost-saving and effective (the highest influence on health with the least cost)
- They should conform to national policies and priorities

Acknowledgements:

The present study was conducted under supervision of the governance scope committee of "the committee for health and sanitation strategic studies at Tehran Municipality" and the department general of performance control and system improvement and in cooperation with a team of experts at social science research center, Jihad Daneshgahi (Academic Crusade), Tehran University. Hence we offer our gratitude for the efforts of these dear people.

ⁱ Iran University Of Medical Sciences ,IUMS , Deputy of Education Municipality of Tehran

ⁱⁱ Ministry of Health Expert

ⁱⁱⁱ General Director of performance management & management development

^{iv} Planning and urban development Deputy of Tehran Municipality